

**MULTI-LEVEL FARMING SYSTEM FOR TILAPIA (*Oreochromis niloticus*),
RABBIT (*Oryctolagus cuniculus*), AND LETTUCE (*Lactuca sativa*)
UNDER A GREENHOUSE**

**JOHN MCLEAN Q. GARCIA
CAMILLE D. MAG-ISA**

An Undergraduate Thesis Submitted to the Faculty of the Department of Agricultural and
Biosystems Engineering, College of Engineering, Central Luzon State University,
Science City of Muñoz, Nueva Ecija, Philippines
in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
for the Degree of

**BACHELOR OF SCIENCE IN AGRICULTURAL AND
BIOSYSTEMS ENGINEERING
(AB Land and Water Resources Engineering)**

JUNE 2023

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
LIST OF TABLES	viii
LIST OF FIGURES	ix
LIST OF APPENDICES	x
LIST OF APPENDIX TABLES	xi
LIST OF APPENDIX FIGURES	xiv
ABSTRACT	xv
INTRODUCTION	
Background of the Study	1
Statement of the Problem	2
Objectives of the Study	3
Significance of the Study	4
Scope and Limitations of the Study	4
Time and Place of the Study	5
REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE	
Vertical Farming System	6
Aquaponics Farming System	7
Methods of Aquaponics System	7
Aeration	9
The Nitrogen Cycle	9
Fish Farming	10
Production of Nile Tilapia (<i>Oreochromis niloticus</i>)	11
Stocking Density of Tilapia	12
Feeding Ratio	13
Lettuce Farming	13
Production of Lettuce in the Past Years	15
Water Quality in Aquaponics	16
Filter in Aquaponics System	17
pH Level	17
Rabbit Production	18
Rabbit Manure	19
Greenhouse Technology	21

METHODOLOGY

Conceptualization of the Study	23
Procedural Framework of the Study	23
Set up of the Study	24
Materials and Instruments	25
Greenhouse Monitoring Factor	26
Experimental Layout and Design	26
Evaluation of the Farming	30
Treatment in the System	30
Layout Design in Greenhouse	30
System Management	30
Fish and Plant Management	31
Rabbit Management	32
Rabbit Dung Management	32
Water Quality Monitoring	32
Acclimation	33
Additional Water Input	33
Harvesting and Sampling	33
Cost Analysis	34
Data Gathering	35

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Tilapia Performance	38
Environmental Factors	40
Water Quality Parameter	41
Water Temperature	41
The pH	42
Total Dissolved Solids	44
Electrical Conductivity	46
Dissolved Oxygen	46
Growth Yield of Lettuce	47
Growth and Yield in Vertical Tower	48
Growth and Yield in Multi-level System	49
Weight of rabbit	50
Food Productivity	51
Cost Analysis	53
Other Observations	54
System Design	55

SUMMARY, CONCLUSION, AND RECOMMENDATION	57
-----------------------------------------	----

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE		PAGE
1	The crops to be grown, their characteristics and schedule of harvest	16
2	Materials and instruments	25
3	Fish feeding strategy	33
4	Cost analysis of the multi-level system	48

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE		PAGE
1	Location map	5
2	The nitrogen cycle	9
3	Conceptual framework of the study	25
4	Multi-level systems	26
5	Experimental layout of the study inside the greenhouse	30
6	Top view of the study area inside the greenhouse	31
7	Side view of the greenhouse with the vertical farming systems	31
8	Multi-level and vertical farming system inside the greenhouse	32
9	Water quality monitoring	35
10	Weighing of harvested lettuce	36
11	The bi-weekly weight of tilapia in the different systems	38
12	The survival rate of Nile tilapia grown in the different systems	39
13	Temperature in the greenhouse	40
14	Weekly mean of water temperature for 8 am	42
15	Weekly mean of water temperature for 5 pm	42
16	Weekly mean of pH for 8 am	43
17	Weekly mean of pH for 5 pm	44
18	Weekly mean of TDS for 8 am	45

19	Weekly mean of TDS for 5 pm	45
20	Weekly mean of Dissolved oxygen for 8 am	46
21	Weekly mean of Dissolved oxygen for 5 pm	47
22	Vertical lettuce weight	48
23	The lettuce weight in multi-level system	49
24	Mean Weight of Rabbit (kg)	50
25	The ammonia and nitrate content in the aquaponics system.	53

LIST OF APPENDICES

APPENDIX		PAGE
1	Request Letter to BFAR for Nile Tilapia	74
2	Approved Letter from PreDiCt	75

LIST OF APPENDIX TABLES

APPENDIX TABLE		PAGE
1	Dissolved Oxygen	70
2	pH	70
3	Total Dissolved Solids	70
4	Electric Conductivity	70
5	Water Temperature in Aquaponics	71
6	Rabbit Weight	71
7	Nile Tilapia Weight	71
8	Survival Rate of Nile Tilapia	72
9	Weight in Multi-level Lettuce	72
10	Weight of Vertical Lettuce Tower	72
11	Analysis of variance table of Dissolved Oxygen	72
12	Analysis of variance table of pH	73
13	Analysis of variance table of Electrical Conductivity	73
14	Analysis of variance table of Total Dissolved Solids	73
15	Analysis of variance table of Water Temperature	73
16	Analysis of variance table of Rabbit Weight	74
17	Analysis of variance table of Tilapia Weight	74
18	Analysis of variance table of Survival Rate of Nile Tilapia	74

19	Analysis of variance table of Vertical Lettuce Weight	74
20	Analysis of variance table of Multi-level Weight of Lettuce	75
21	LSD Comparison for Dissolved Oxygen (AM)	75
22	LSD Comparison for Dissolved Oxygen (PM)	75
23	LSD Comparison for pH (AM)	75
24	LSD Comparison for pH (PM)	76
25	LSD Comparison for Tilapia Weight	76

LIST OF APPENDIX FIGURES

APPENDIX FIGURE		PAGE
1	Greenhouse preparation	77
2	Pre-testing of the system	77
3	Preparation of lettuce seed	78
4	Preparation of rabbit dung for tilapia feed	78
5	Seed germination	78
6	Preparation for transplanting	79
7	Transplanting of lettuce in the vertical tower	79
8	Transplanting of lettuce in the multi-level system	79
9	Data gathering	80
10	Measuring of the crops	80
11	Tilapia data gathering	81
12	Weighing of rabbit for data	81
13	Checking of lettuce with disease	81
14	Feeding of rabbit	82
15	Water quality testing	82
16	Harvesting of lettuce	83
17	Weighing of tilapia	83
18	Harvested crop and aquaculture	84

ABSTRACT

MAG-ISA, CAMILLE D. and **GARCIA JOHN MCLEAN Q.**, Department of Agricultural and Biosystems Engineering, College of Engineering, Central Luzon State University, Science City of Muñoz, Nueva Ecija, Philippines, **JUNE 2023, MULTI-LEVEL FARMING SYSTEM FOR TILAPIA (*Oreochromis niloticus*), RABBIT (*Oryctolagus cuniculus*), AND LETTUCE (*Lactuca sativa*) UNDER A GREENHOUSE**

Adviser: GLORIA N. RAMOS, M.Sc.

To investigate the growth and yield of lettuce (*Lactuca sativa*) using Nile Tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus*) culture with a percentage of rabbit dung in their feeds, a controlled environment greenhouse was equipped with three recirculating aquaponics systems, each replicated three times. Within the systems, water was lifted from an 800L IBC Tank to Hydroponics NFT System using 60-watt submersible pump. The water depth maintained at 800 Liter and hydroponically germinated lettuce seedlings planted on a sponge after 30 days of stocking 50 Nile Tilapia per IBC tank. Throughout the study, the environmental conditions and water quality parameter were carefully monitored. After 90 days, data were collected for lettuce, tilapia and rabbit. The results indicated that the systems maintained an average dissolved oxygen of 3.26-3.94 ppm. The pH level ranged from 7.87-8.01, promoting the retarded growth of tilapia and lettuce. Despite a low total TDS level less than 260 ppm, which was below the required threshold, the elevated pH hindered the growth of the lettuce. Among the three treatments, Treatment 3 (100% Commercial Feeds) demonstrated the highest growth and success in Nile Tilapia culture. Treatment 2 (20% rabbit dung, 80% Commercial feeds) performed best in terms of weight of lettuce and number of leaves in the multi-level system. In vertical tower, Treatment 2 demonstrated

the highest weight and length of leaves. In comparison for the lettuce in the multi-level system compared to the lettuce in vertical tower, the vertical tower showed higher weight, number of leaves and length of leaves.

Keywords: aquaponics; hydroponics; multi-level system

REFERENCES

- Agius, C. (2015). The yield and quality of lettuce crop, grown in different growing media. Division of Rural Sciences and Food Systems Institute of Earth Systems University of Malta. 10.13140/RG.2.2.19438.20801. [online] Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/314121919_The_yield_and_quality_of_lettuce_crop_grown_in_different_growing_media
- Adewumi, A. A., Adewumi, I. K., & Olaleye, V. F. (2011). Livestock waste-menace: Fish wealth-solution. *African journal of environmental science and technology*, 5(3), 149-154.
- BARRY, C.B. 1996. The handbook to Hydroponic Nutrient Solutions. Casper Publications Pty. Ltd. Narrabeen, NSW, Australia
- Borah, B. C. Technical Viability Of Incorporation Of Low Cost Aquaponics In Integrated Chicken-Fish Farming System. Retrieved from: http://thebioscan.com/journals/1_142-DR.%20BIBHA%20CHETIA%20BORAH-WC.pdf
- Bailey, D. S., Rakocy, J. E., Cole, W. M., Shultz, K. A., & St Croix, U. S. (1997, November). Economic analysis of a commercial-scale aquaponic system for the production of tilapia and lettuce. In *Tilapia aquaculture: proceedings of the fourth international symposium on Tilapia in aquaculture*, Orlando, Florida (pp. 603-612). Retrieved from: https://images.indiegogo.com/medias/394863/files/20120818104616-Economic_Analysis_of_a_Commercial-Scale_Aquaponic_System.pdf
- Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources (BFAR), (2022). PHILIPPINE TILAPIA INDUSTRY ROADMAP 2022-2025. ISO 900:2015. CIP 5387/19/12/1117. Retrieved from: <http://www.pcaf.da.gov.ph/wp-content/uploads/2022/06/Philippine-Tilapia-Industry-Roadmap-2022-2025.pdf>
- Both, A. J. (2002). Ten years of hydroponic lettuce research. The State University of New Jersey, New Jersey. Retrieved from: https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Aj-Both-2/publication/266453402_TEN_YEARS_OF_HYDROPONIC_LETTUCE_RESEARCH/links/544abeb30cf2bcc9b1d30958/TEN-YEARS-OF-HYDROPONIC-LETTUCE-RESEARCH.pdf
- Beecher L. (2021). *Aquaponics: System Layout and Components*. (2022). Retrieved 26 October 2022, from <https://lgpress.clemson.edu/publication/aquaponics-system-layout-and-components>

- Dediu, L., Cristea, V., & Xiaoshuan, Z. (2012). Waste production and valorization in an integrated aquaponic system with bester and lettuce. *African Journal of Biotechnology*, 11(9), 2349-2358. Retrieved from: <https://www.ajol.info/index.php/ajb/article/view/100608>
- Combining rabbit and fish farming --- a win-win situation. (2021). Zhengzhou Alpha Machinery Co., Limited. <https://www.alphaerator.com/post/combining-rabbit-and-fish-farming-a-win-win-situation>
- Dalai, S. et al. (2020). Green-houses: Types and Structural Components. In: *Protected Cultivation and Smart Agriculture*, edited by Sagar Maitra, Dinkar J Gaikwad and Tanmoy Shankar. New Delhi Publishers. New Delhi: 2020, (pp. 09-17). ISBN: 978-81-948993-2-7, DOI: 10.30954/NDP-PCSA.2020.2
- Das, R. & Bhattacharjee, C. (2020). Chapter 9 - Lettuce, Edited by Amit K. Jaiswal. *Nutritional Composition and Antioxidant Properties of Fruits and Vegetables*. Academic Press, Pages 143-157. ISBN 9780128127803. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-812780-3.00009-X>. [online] Retrieved from <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/B978012812780300009X>
- Elsaidy, N., Abouelenien, F., & Kirrella, G. A. (2015). Impact of using raw or fermented manure as fish feed on microbial quality of water and fish. *The Egyptian Journal of Aquatic Research*, 41(1), 93-100.
- Elferink, M., Schierhorn, F. (2016). Global Demand for Food Is Rising. Can We Meet It?. Retrieved 22 December 2022, from <https://hbr.org/2016/04/global-demand-for-food-is-rising-can-we-meet-it>
- El-Sayed, A. (2020). Chapter 13 - Technological innovations, *Tilapia Culture (Second Edition)*, Academic Press. Pages 297-328. ISBN 9780128165096. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-816509-6.00013-6>.
- Environmental factors affecting plant growth. (2019). Retrieved 12 June 2023, from <https://extension.oregonstate.edu/gardening/techniques/environmental-factors-affecting-plant-growth#:~:text=buds%20will%20form.,Temp>
- Finizola e Silva, M., & Van Passel, S. (2020). Climate-smart agriculture in the northeast of Brazil: an integrated assessment of the aquaponics technology. *Sustainability*, 12(9), 3734.
- FAO. (2021). *Fishery and Aquaculture Statistics. Global aquaculture production 1950-2019 (FishstatJ)*. In: FAO Fisheries Division [online]. Rome. Updated 2021.
- Finch, H., Lane, G., & Samuel, A. (2014). Fresh produce crops, Chapter 17. In *Woodhead Publishing Series in Food Science, Technology and Nutrition*,

- Lockhart & Wiseman's Crop Husbandry Including Grassland (Ninth Edition), Woodhead Publishing, Pages 396-430. ISBN 9781782423713. <https://doi.org/10.1533/9781782423928.3.396>. [online] Retrieved from <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/B9781782423713500175>
- Geisenhoff, L. O., Jordan, R. A., Santos, R. C., Oliveira, F. C. D., & Gomes, E. P. (2016). Effect of different substrates in aquaponic lettuce production associated with intensive tilapia farming with water recirculation systems. *Engenharia Agrícola*, 36, 291-299. Retrieved from: <https://www.scielo.br/j/eagri/a/V7hdNK6RrXtGYcZnLqyfNss/?lang=en>
- Gonzaga, N., Pepito, S. L., Octavio, R., & Rogers, G. (2017). Growth and yield performance of lettuce (*Lactuca sativa* Linn) under protected and conventional cultivation. *Annals of Tropical Research* 39(SUPPLEMENT B):137-143(2017) DOI: <https://doi.org/10.32945/atr39sb11.2017>.
- Gruda, N. (2005). Impact of environmental factors on product quality of greenhouse vegetables for fresh consumption. *Critical reviews in plant sciences*, 24(3), 227-247. Retrieved from: https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Nazim-Gruda/publication/240518241_Impact_of_Environmental_Factors_on_Product_Quality_of_Greenhouse_Vegetables_for_Fresh_Consumption/links/0046352033e74ad0030000000/Impact-of-Environmental-Factors-on-Product-Quality-of-Greenhouse-Vegetables-for-Fresh-Consumption.pdf
- Goddek, Simon; Joyce, Alyssa; Kotzen, Benz; Burnell, Gavin M. (2019). Aquaponics Food Production Systems (Combined Aquaculture and Hydroponic Production Technologies for the Future) || *Hydroponic Technologies*, 10.1007/978-3-030-15943-6(Chapter 4), 77-110. doi:10.1007/978-3-030-15943-6_4
- Jadhav, H., & Rosentrater, K. (2017). Economic and Environmental Analysis of Greenhouse Crop Production with Special Reference to Low Cost Greenhouses: A Review. American Society of Agricultural and Biological Engineers, St. Joseph, Michigan www.asabe.org. Annual International Meeting 1701178.(doi:10.13031/aim.201701178)
- Kyaw, T. Y., & Ng, A. K. (2017). Smart aquaponics system for urban farming. *Energy procedia*, 143, 342-347. Retrieved from: <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1876610217364585>
- Kalantari, F., Mohd Tahir, O., Mahmoudi Lahijani, A., & Kalantari, S. (2017). A review of vertical farming technology: A guide for implementation of building integrated agriculture in cities. In *Advanced engineering forum* (Vol. 24, pp. 76-91). Trans Tech Publications Ltd. Retrieved from: <https://www.scientific.net/AEF.24.76>

- Kozai, T., Masabni, J., & Niu, G. (2021). *Plant Factory Basics, Applications and Advances*. Academic Press. Pages 439-449. ISBN 9780323851527. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-323-85152-7.20001-3>.
- Lukefahr, S. D., & Oseni, S. O. (2021, November). Vertical rabbit farming integrative systems for cities: Models and opportunities—A bibliographic review. In *Proceedings of the 12th World Rabbit Congress, Nantes, France* (pp. 3-5). Retrieved from: <http://world-rabbit-science.com/WRSA-Proceedings/Congress-2021-Nantes/Papers/Open%20session/O-06.pdf>
- MALCOLM, J. 2007. *Backyard Aquaponics Magazine*, Issue 1, Summer 2007. (Retrieved from https://www.byapmagazine.com/BYAP_Magazine_Issue1.pdf on December 2022)
- MORGAN, L. 2008. *Nutrient temperature-oxygen and pythium in hydroponics. Simply hydroponics and organics*. Florida, USA.
- Maucieri, C., Nicoletto, C., Junge, R., Schmautz, Z., Sambo, P., & Borin, M. (2018). Hydroponic systems and water management in aquaponics: A review. *Italian Journal of Agronomy*, 13(1), 1-11.
- Rakocy, J., Shultz, R. C., Bailey, D. S., & Thoman, E. S. (2003, February). Aquaponic production of tilapia and basil: comparing a batch and staggered cropping system. In *South Pacific Soilless Culture Conference-SPSCC 648* (pp. 63-69).
- Rakocy, J. E. (2007). Ten guidelines for aquaponic systems. *Aquaponics J*, 46, 14-17.
- Sace, C.F., 2008. *Water Management System for Honeydew Melon (Cucumis melo L.) Production Grown in hydroponic System under Tropical Greenhouse Condition Central Luzon State University, Science City of Munoz, Nueva Ecija, Philippines* 175p.
- NELSON, R.L. 2008. *Aquaponic Equipment: The Biofilter*. *Aquaponics Journal*. Issue #48. First Quarter 2008. Nelson and Pade, Inc.
- Nicolas, H. J., & Bradecina, J. M. S. (2021). Development and Evaluation of Learning Modules in Rabbit Production. *Int J Edu Sci*, 35(1-3), 51-57. Retrieved from: https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Honeylet-Nicolas/publication/356255510_Development_and_Evaluation_of_Learning_Modules_in_Rabbit_Production
- Philippine Statistics Authority (PSA). *OpenSTAT Database Portal*. <https://openstat.psa.gov.ph/>
- RAKOCY, J.E. 1989. *Tank Culture of Tilapia*. SRAC Publication No.282, September 1989. (Retrieved from http://aquanic.org/publicat/usda_rac/efs/srac/282fs.pdf on December 2022)

- RAKOCY, JE., M.P. MASSER and T.M. LOSORDO. 2006. Aquaponics- Integrating Fish and Plant. Recirculating Aquaculture Tank Production Systems, SRAC Publication No.454. (Retrieved from <https://extension.ag.uidaho.edu/twinfalls/Aquaculture/Aqua%20Pubs/SRAC454AquaponicSystem.pdf> on December 2022)
- RORABAUGH, P.A. 201. Introduction to Hydroponics and Controlled environment Agriculture) Manual-PLS217). Controlled Environment Agriculture Center, University of Arizona, Tucson, Arizona, USA.
- Rakocy, J. E. (2007). Ten guidelines for aquaponic systems. *Aquaponics J*, 46, 14-17. Retrieved from: <https://www.leaffin.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/Aquaponics-Journal-10-Guidelines.pdf>
- SACE, CF and FITZSIMMONS, K. 2011. Vegetable Production in Recirculating Aquaponics System using Nile Tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus*) with and without Freshwater Prawn (*Macrobrachium rosenbergii*). College of Agriculture and Life Sciences, University of Arizona. Tucson, Arizona USA.
- Sace, C. F., & Natividad Jr, E. P. (2015). Economic analysis of an urban vertical garden for hydroponic production of lettuce (*Lactuca sativa*). *International Journal of Contemporary Applied Sciences*, 2(7), 42-56. Retrieved from: https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Chito-Sace/publication/348080201_Economic_Analysis_of_an_Urban_Vertical_Garden_for_Hydroponic_Production_of_Lettuce_Lactuca_sativa/links/5f6ea03a45851553a00d28d0/Economic-Analysis-of-an-Urban-Vertical-Garden-for-Hydroponic-Production-of-Lettuce-Lactuca-sativa.pdf/links/61a0613f6a0f6e76c2aea6bf/Development-and-Evaluation-of-Learning-Modules-in-Rabbit-Production.pdf
- Sawyer, T. (2010). Aquaponic Gardening Rules of Thumb |The Aquaponic Source. Retrieved 27 June 2023, from <https://www.theaquaponicsource.com/aquaponic-gardening-rules-of-thumb/>
- Veneracion, A. (2017, November 21). An Overview of the Rabbit Industry in the Philippines. *Agriculture Magazine*. <https://www.agriculture.com.ph/2017/11/21/an-overview-of-the-rabbit-industry-in-the-philippines/>
- Vyas, K. (2018). 13 Vertical Farming Innovations That Could Revolutionize Agriculture. *Interesting Engineering*. Retrieved from: <https://interestingengineering.com/innovation/13-vertical-farming-innovations-that-could-revolutionize-agriculture>
- Tabaro, S. R., Mutanga, O., Rugege, D., & Micha, J. C. (2012). Rabbit droppings as an organic fertilizer in earthen ponds, to improve growth and production of Nile tilapia, *Oreochromis niloticus* L., in Rwanda. *Rwanda Journal*, 28, 11-38.

- Tawaha A., Wahab P., et. al., (2021). Yield and Nutrients Leaf Content of Butterhead Lettuce (*Lactuca Sativa*) in Response to Fish Nutrient Solution in a Small Scale of Aquaponic Systems. *Journal of Ecological Engineering*. DOI:10.12912/27197050/141524
- Wheeler, T. R., Hadley, P., Morison, J. I. L., & Ellis, R. H. (1993). Effects of temperature on the growth of lettuce (*Lactuca sativa* L.) and the implications for assessing the impacts of potential climate change. *European Journal of Agronomy*, 2(4), 305–311. doi:10.1016/s1161-0301(14)80178-0
- The Most Common Aquaponics Problems - Go Green Aquaponics. (2022). Retrieved 23 September 2022, from <https://gogreenaquaponics.com/blogs/news/the-most-common-aquaponics-problems-and-how-to-fix-them>
- University, U. (2022). Lettuce in the Garden. Retrieved 27 October 2022, from <https://extension.usu.edu/yardandgarden/research/lettuce-in-the-garden#:~:text=Lettuce%20can%20be%2>